115 STATE STREET MONTPELIER, VT 05633-5201 PHONE: (802) 828-2228

FAX: (802) 828-2424



REP. ANNE THERESA O'BRIEN, CO-CHAIR SEN. DIANE SNELLING, CO-CHAIR REP. DEBBIE EVANS SEN. ANTHONY POLLINA REP. DAVE SHARPE SEN. ROBERT STARR REP. TRISTAN TOLENO

# STATE OF VERMONT GENERAL ASSEMBLY GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE

# Government Accountability Committee January 2015 Report

#### Introduction

In the past year, the Government Accountability Committee (GAC) has continued to focus on how results-based accountability (RBA) can be used as a tool to assist Vermont State government to develop a culture of performance accountability across State government in order to be more accountable to Vermonters. Generally speaking, RBA involves setting high-level outcomes, collecting data, and then analyzing that data to gauge how well the State is performing. RBA helps our government operate more effectively and in a manner that demonstrates to taxpayers how their money is being spent to achieve desired outcomes.

Pursuant to 2 V.S.A. § 970(g), this report sets forth GAC's activities and recommendations to the General Assembly. This report will detail the following issues:

#### 1. RBA's current use in State government.

Recommendation: The General Assembly and the Executive Branch should continue to use RBA as it has been established in 2014 Acts and Resolves

No. 186 (an act relating to reporting on population-level outcomes and indicators

and on program-level performance measures) and in the Vantage Performance Budget (formerly named the Performance Measure Pilot Program)<sup>1</sup>.

### 2. Using performance accountability and RBA terminology consistently.

<u>Recommendation</u>: The General Assembly should enact legislation that will be introduced by GAC members in both chambers. This legislation would amend Vermont laws in order to use performance accountability and RBA terminology consistently throughout the law.

#### 3. RBA Training in the Legislative Branch.

Recommendation: All legislators should participate in RBA training during the 2015 legislative session in order to learn how RBA can be used in the legislative process and to foster performance accountability. Employees in the Executive Branch who interact with the General Assembly should also participate in this training to the extent possible because RBA requires a collaborative approach between the two Branches.

#### 1. RBA's Current Use in State Government

Using RBA, the State's performance is evaluated at two different levels: population-level (meaning, Vermonters as a whole, or certain overall populations of Vermonters, such as Vermont youth) and program-level (meaning, individual programs).

The General Assembly, as the Legislative Branch, sets the policy for the State.

By the laws it enacts, it sets the course for the population-level, and funds programs that support the population-level outcomes. The Executive Branch implements legislative policy by administering the programs that contribute to population-level outcomes.

VT LEG #303559 v.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See **Attachment A** for a list of programs participating in the Vantage Performance Budget

The General Assembly created a requirement to use RBA to evaluate how well the State is performing at the population- and program-levels when it enacted 2014 Acts and Resolves No. 186 (an act relating to reporting on population-level outcomes and indicators and on program-level performance measures). In the act, the General Assembly codified in statute eight main population-level quality of life outcomes, which are broad goals for Vermont's population, such as "Vermonters are healthy." It also established initial population-level indicators (and a process to revise those indicators) for each outcome. Indicators reflect data that will be collected, and they relate to outcomes. For example, "number of adults who are homeless" is an indicator for the outcome that "Vermonters are healthy."

The act then requires the Executive Branch's Chief Performance Officer to report annually to the General Assembly on the State's progress in reaching the population-level outcomes by providing data for the indicators. Over time, the General Assembly will be able to analyze the data for those indicators to determine whether its policies are successful in working toward the outcomes.

Similarly, the act requires the Chief Performance Officer to report annually on the Vantage Performance Budget. In the Vantage Performance Budget, the Executive Branch analyzes the results of participating programs using performance measure data. The Vantage Performance Budget, and similar performance analysis requirements for Executive Branch programs set forth in statute, are a way for the Executive Branch to evaluate whether its programs are improving the lives of the Vermonters it serves.

The act also requires the Chief Performance Officer to designate an employee in each agency of State government to be a performance accountability liaison to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://www.leg.state.vt.us/DOCS/2014/ACTS/ACT186.PDF

General Assembly. These liaisons — or "PALs" — are responsible for responding to any requests for performance information requested by the General Assembly, and they should help serve as a link for the two branches of State government to collaborate on performance accountability across State government.

The GAC recommends that this foundation for performance accountability and RBA continue in State government. The act sets the State on a course to analyze how well it is performing so that it can be more effective in the future.

#### 2. Using RBA Terminology Consistently

The GAC stresses the importance of using performance accountability and RBA terminology consistently so that we are all speaking the same language. In RBA, "outcomes" and "indicators" are reserved for the population-level, and "goals," "results," and "performance measures" are reserved for the program-level. Moreover, "targets" might be established as goals for certain time frames, and State government might compare its performance to standards elsewhere, such as on a national or industry level, and these standards are "benchmarks."

Right now, Vermont laws that include performance analysis requirements are not always using these terms consistently. GAC members from each chamber will introduce legislation during the 2015 session that makes amendments to these laws for the purpose of promoting the use of consistent performance accountability and RBA terms. The General Assembly should enact this legislation because speaking the same language will make it easier for performance accountability and RBA to become embedded in the operation of our State government.

#### 3. Training in the Legislative Branch

Finally, the GAC strongly recommends that the General Assembly embrace performance accountability and RBA at the legislative level. As the branch of government that sets the policy for the State, it is imperative that the General Assembly evaluate whether its decisions are having a positive impact on Vermont. This is the essence of government effectiveness and accountability.

RBA can be condensed into three main program questions: 1) How much did we do? 2) How well did we do it? 3) Is anyone better off? Data provided by the Executive Branch will support answers to these questions and can help the General Assembly determine whether current policy should change in order make a more positive impact.

Some GAC members have already been trained on how to use RBA, and there are community partners that also understand the mechanics of RBA. The GAC recommends that to embed RBA further in the legislative process, legislators and others already trained in RBA should help train other legislators on how to use this tool.

To do so, the GAC has worked to plan RBA training as follows:

- Wednesday, January 14th at 2:30 p.m. in Room 11: House and Senate
   Committees on Appropriations will jointly be trained on RBA using the
   Vantage Performance Budget.
- Friday, January 16th at 2:30 p.m. in the House Chamber: House "Caucus of the Whole" will obtain RBA 101 training.
- Wednesday, January 21st at 4:45 p.m.: House committee chairs will obtain executive-level RBA training.

Additionally, a Senate "Caucus of the Whole" RBA 101 training is being planned, as well as House and Senate joint committee training on applied RBA, which shall be led by trained facilitators.

The GAC further suggests that employees in the Executive Branch that come before the committees of jurisdiction — especially the PALs — should also attend the joint committee training to the extent possible, because the Legislative Branch will expect the Executive Branch to be able to answer the three RBA questions for programs.

And finally, once committee members are trained, committees should start to use RBA in practice. The GAC recommends that committees start with the budgets of the programs participating in the Vantage Performance Budget that are within the committees' jurisdiction. These programs will already have data in the form of performance measures, and the committees — with their subject-matter knowledge — will be able to make more informed recommendations to the House and Senate Committees on Appropriations in their decision making for the budget.

The GAC looks forward to this RBA training and how it will assist the Legislative and Executive Branches.

## **Attachment A**

Department         Program/Activity Area           Administration - Agency Secretary's Office         State Workers' Compensation Insurance           Administration - BGS         Federal Surplus Property           Administration - DII         Availability/Uptime of Critical Systems           Administration - Finance & Management         Internal Controls Self-Assessment Program           Administration - Human Resources         1) Classification Review; 2) State Employee Wellness Program           Administration - Libraries         Resource Sharing: Interlibrary Loan Program           Administration - Tax         1) Current Use; 2) refund fraud program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program           Administration - Tax         1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development           Attorney General         Court diversion           Commerce & Community Development         Tourism and marketing           Education         1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth)           Financial Regulations         Insurance           Green Mt. Care Board         Health Care Costs           Human Services - Children & Families         General assistance           Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health         Vermont Chronic Care Initiative           Access         Vermont Evolusion           Human Services - Health         ADAP	Programs Participating in the	e Vantage Performance Budget
Administration - BGS Administration - DII Availability/Uptime of Critical Systems Administration - Finance & Management Administration - Human Resources Administration - Libraries Administration - Libraries Administration - Libraries Resource Sharing: Interlibrary Loan Program Administration - Tax 1) Classification Review; 2) State Employee Wellness Program Administration - Tax 1) Current Use; 2) refund fraud program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program Agriculture 1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development) Attorney General Court diversion Commerce & Community Development Tourism and marketing 1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth) Financial Regulations Insurance Green Mt. Care Board Health Care Costs Human Services - Children & Families General assistance Human Services - Orections Correctional Services Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living Human Services - Health ADAP Human Services - Mental Health Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital Judiciary Dispute Resolution Apprenticeship Program Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife Support & Field Services Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation Public Safety Cannabis Registry Public Good Requests	Department	Program/Activity Area
Administration – DII Availability/Uptime of Critical Systems Administration – Finance & Management Internal Controls Self-Assessment Program Administration - Human Resources 1) Classification Review; 2) State Employee Wellness Program Administration – Libraries Resource Sharing: Interlibrary Loan Program Administration – Tax 1) Current Use; 2) refund fraud program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program.  Agriculture 1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development)  Attorney General Court diversion  Court diversion  Tourism and marketing Education 1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth)  Insurance  Green Mt. Care Board Health Care Costs  Human Services - Children & Families General assistance  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Tell home and community based waiver  Living Dispute Resolution  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Environmental Vermont Ecycles Program  Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife Support & Field Services  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Administration - Agency Secretary's Office	State Workers' Compensation Insurance
Administration – Finance & Management Internal Controls Self-Assessment Program Administration - Human Resources 1) Classification Review; 2) State Employee Wellness Program Administration – Libraries Resource Sharing: Interlibrary Loan Program Administration – Tax 1) Current Use; 2) refund fraud program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program Agriculture 1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development) Attorney General Court diversion Commerce & Community Development Tourism and marketing Education 1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth) Financial Regulations Insurance Green Mt. Care Board Health Care Costs Human Services - Children & Families General assistance Human Services - Orrections Correctional Services Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living Human Services - Health ADAP Human Services - Mental Health Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital Judiciary Dispute Resolution Labor Apprenticeship Program Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation State parks Recreation Public Safety Cannabis Registry Public Safety Cannabis Registry Public Service Board	Administration - BGS	Federal Surplus Property
Administration - Human Resources  Administration - Libraries  Administration - Libraries  Administration - Tax  Administration - Tax  Administration - Tax  Administration - Tax  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Agriculture  Court diversion  Commerce & Community Development  Education  Tourism and marketing  Education  Insurance  Green Mt. Care Board  Health Care Costs  Human Services - Children & Families  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent  Living  Human Services - Health  ADAP  Human Services - Health  Human Services - Mental Health  Judiciary  Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and  Recreation  Public Safety  Public Good Requests	Administration – DII	Availability/Uptime of Critical Systems
Administration – Libraries Resource Sharing: Interlibrary Loan Program Administration – Tax 1) Current Use; 2) refund fraud program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program Agriculture 1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development) Attorney General Court diversion Commerce & Community Development Tourism and marketing Education 1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth) Financial Regulations Insurance Green Mt. Care Board Health Care Costs Human Services - Children & Families General assistance Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living TBI home and community based waiver Living TBI home and community based waiver Living Dispute Resolution Labor Apprenticeship Program Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation Services Natural Resources - Firsh & Wildlife Support & Field Services Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation Public Good Requests	Administration – Finance & Management	Internal Controls Self-Assessment Program
Administration – Tax  1) Current Use; 2) refund fraud program, and 3) Top 100 compliance program  Agriculture  1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development)  Attorney General  Court diversion  Commerce & Community Development  Education  1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth)  Financial Regulations  Green Mt. Care Board  Health Care Costs  Human Services - Children & Families  General assistance  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health  Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health  Human Services - Mental Health  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Good Requests	Administration - Human Resources	
Agriculture  Agriculture  1) Food safety and consumer protection; 2) Working Lands (Agriculture Development)  Attorney General  Court diversion  Commerce & Community Development  Education  1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth)  Financial Regulations  Insurance  Green Mt. Care Board  Health Care Costs  Human Services - Children & Families  General assistance  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Mental Health  ADAP  Human Services - Mental Health  Judiciary  Liabor  Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Good Requests	Administration – Libraries	Resource Sharing: Interlibrary Loan Program
Attorney General Court diversion Commerce & Community Development Education Tourism and marketing Education 1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth) Financial Regulations Insurance Green Mt. Care Board Health Care Costs Human Services - Children & Families General assistance Human Services - Corrections Correctional Services Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access Table Insurance Table Insurance Green Mt. Care Board Health Care Costs Human Services - Corrections Form Chronic Care Initiative Table Insurance	Administration – Tax	
Commerce & Community Development  Education  1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth)  Financial Regulations  Insurance  Green Mt. Care Board  Health Care Costs  Human Services - Children & Families  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health  Human Services - Health  ADAP  Human Services - Mental Health  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Labor  Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Good Requests	Agriculture	
Education  1) Adult education and literacy; 2) Tobacco Litigation (youth)  Financial Regulations  Green Mt. Care Board  Health Care Costs  Human Services - Children & Families  General assistance  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health  ADAP  Human Services - Mental Health  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Labor  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Good Requests	Attorney General	Court diversion
Litigation (youth)  Financial Regulations  Green Mt. Care Board  Human Services - Children & Families  Human Services - Corrections  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health  ADAP  Human Services - Health  Human Services - Mental Health  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Labor  Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Liquor Good Requests	Commerce & Community Development	Tourism and marketing
Green Mt. Care Board Human Services - Children & Families General assistance Human Services - Corrections Correctional Services Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living Human Services - Health Human Services - Health Human Services - Mental Health Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital Judiciary Dispute Resolution Labor Apprenticeship Program Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation Public Safety Public Good Requests	Education	
Human Services - Children & Families  Human Services - Corrections  Correctional Services  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health  Human Services - Health  ADAP  Human Services - Mental Health  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Labor  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control  Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Environmental  Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Good Requests	Financial Regulations	Insurance
Human Services - Corrections  Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health  Human Services - Health  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Labor  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control  Ratural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Correctional Services  Vermont Chronic Care Initiative  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Services Hospital  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Service Hospital  Service Hospital  ADAP	Green Mt. Care Board	Health Care Costs
Human Services - Dept. of Vermont Health Access  Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living  Human Services - Health Human Services - Health ADAP  Human Services - Mental Health Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Judiciary Dispute Resolution Labor Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety Public Service Board  Vermont Chronic Care Initiative  Vermont Community based waiver  TBI home and community based waiver  TBI home and community based waiver  TBI home and community based waiver  Tell home and community based waiver  Tell home and community based waiver  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital  Vermont Ecycles Program  State parks  Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Human Services - Children & Families	General assistance
Access Human Services - Disabilities & Independent Living Human Services - Health Human Services - Health ADAP Human Services - Mental Health Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital Judiciary Dispute Resolution Labor Apprenticeship Program Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation Vermont Ecycles Program  Vermont Ecycles Program  State Parks Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation Public Safety Public Good Requests	Human Services - Corrections	Correctional Services
Living Human Services - Health ADAP Human Services - Mental Health Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital Judiciary Dispute Resolution Labor Apprenticeship Program Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation Vermont Ecycles Program  Vermont Ecycles Program  Support & Field Services  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation Public Safety Public Service Board Public Good Requests	•	Vermont Chronic Care Initiative
Human Services - Mental Health  Judiciary  Dispute Resolution  Labor  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control  Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Vermont Ecycles Program  Vermont Ecycles Program  Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests		TBI home and community based waiver
Judiciary  Labor  Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control  Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Dispute Resolution  Apprenticeship Program  Vermont Ecycles Program  Support & Field Services  State parks  Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Human Services - Health	ADAP
Labor Apprenticeship Program  Liquor Control Enforcement and licensing  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife Support & Field Services  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Human Services - Mental Health	Vermont Psychiatric Care Hospital
Liquor Control  Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Enforcement and licensing  Vermont Ecycles Program  Support & Field Services  State parks  Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Judiciary	Dispute Resolution
Natural Resources - Environmental Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Vermont Ecycles Program  Vermont Ecycles Program  Support & Field Services  State parks  Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Labor	Apprenticeship Program
Conservation  Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife  Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Public Service Board  Support & Field Services  State parks  Cannabis Registry  Public Good Requests	Liquor Control	Enforcement and licensing
Natural Resources - Forests, Parks and Recreation  Public Safety  Cannabis Registry  Public Service Board  Public Good Requests		Vermont Ecycles Program
Recreation Public Safety Cannabis Registry Public Service Board Public Good Requests	Natural Resources - Fish & Wildlife	Support & Field Services
Public Service Board Public Good Requests	•	State parks
	Public Safety	Cannabis Registry
Public Service Dept. Consumer Impact	Public Service Board	Public Good Requests
	Public Service Dept.	Consumer Impact

Transportation - Motor Vehicles	Motor Vehicles Customer Service
Transportation - Vtrans	1) Town highway bridges; 2) Paving Program; 3) Interstate Highway Bridge; 4) Safety & Traffic Operations; 5) Public Transit; 6) Rail Program.
Treasurer	Unclaimed property